Does Your Community Have Immunity?
Mobilizing parents who immunize to influence their vaccine-hesitant peers

Presenting authors: Mackenzie Melton, MPH, Dawn Crawford, Clarissa HSU, PhD, Jennie Schoeppe, MPH
Defining the problem – kindergarten exemptions
Turning the tide on vaccine hesitancy

The Need
- Evidence based tools and resources.

The Opportunity
- Direct engagement of parents in settings where they actively seek information.

Our Approach
- Clinical Intervention
- Community Intervention
- Scientific evaluation
Communities can influence vaccine hesitancy

• Parents want to do what’s best for their child.

• Parents gather information & form opinions through social networks.

• Most parents immunize their children

• The voice of immunizing parents is unheard.

• Immunizing parents understand & recognize the value of a healthy community.

• When given compelling information, immunizing parents become activated!
Community Intervention

**Strategies**
- Activate parents who immunize
- Reinforce value of a healthy community
- Engage volunteer advocates
- Provide tools & resources
- Use media to support parents’ engagement

**Tactics**
- Direct engagement
- Local data & expertise
- Child care & schools
- Messages, toolkit & support
- Social media, earned media

**Outcomes**
- Attitudes supporting vaccinations
- Local policy change
- Fewer exemptions
The Immunity Community

Pilot Sites
- Elementary Schools
- Childcare Centers
- Preschools

Parent Advocates
- 1-2 per site
- Training
- Technical Assistance
- 4-6 hrs p/month activities

Community Advisory Board
- 11 members
- Input and Feedback

1 - 2 per site Training
4-6 hrs p/month activities
11 members Input and Feedback

Community Advisory Board

11 members Input and Feedback
“Getting information out, I mean, people are talking about it. Positive or negative, they’re talking about it—the awareness.”
– Parent Advocate

“…positive thing to do with the community, to spread some positive things about vaccinations, because you know, the minority, the anti-vax people tend to be the loudest, right?”
– Parent Advocate
Creating an IMMUNITY COMMUNITY
• Full service communications & fundraising agency that works exclusively with nonprofits across the country

• 12+ years of dedicated nonprofit experience paired with 7+ years of corporate advertising experience

• LOVE PUBLIC HEALTH & VACCINE WORK

Some Of Our Awesome Clients:
Purpose of the Campaign

• Create a pro-vaccine social marketing brand that parents wanted to share with other parents

• An “own-able” look and feel for the project

• Create messages for empower parents to talk about their support of vaccines

• Give parents “peer-to-peer” communications tools

• Pivot off Herd Immunity as our primary reason to vaccinate your family
Complete Communications Package

- Naming & Branding
- Messaging
- Content Development
- Collateral
- Training
- Community Management
Being part of a community means being part of a bigger whole. It means unifying on issues that matter to our community’s health. Immunity Community = UNITY. Heck, you can’t even write immunity or community without unity, that’s just how important it is.

It’s time that we all share our belief that vaccination is a safe and healthy choice for our family. Together we’ll spread knowledge to our community that will stamp out illness and misinformation.

Together we can unify against disease. Together we can unify against misinformation that is confusing parents. Together we can build a Immunity Community that allows us all to thrive.
Graphic Look

• Washington specific
• Diverse
• Fun & Bright
Power to the Parents

• Wire-bound, wipe-able so parents can keep it
• Details about vaccines
• FAQs and talking points
• Great online sources
• How to talk to other parents about vaccines with knowledge and love
• Action steps they can take
MESSAGING
Keystone Statements

• I choose to vaccinate my child.

• Vaccines protect my child from 14 diseases.

• Most of us vaccinate our kids—and I’m glad. It keeps our community healthy and gives diseases fewer opportunities to spread.

• Vaccines are the best choice for my family.
HEART Method

• Hear
• Empathize
• Analyze
• Resources
• Tell
Effective Messages

• Use “I” Statements
• Use Anecdotes
• Share YOUR story
Gracefully Exiting a Tough Conversation

Thank you for sharing your opinions with me. I'm just glad we both care about protecting our kids’ health. Thank you for being so passionate.
CREATIVE & COLLATERAL
Are YOU in the IMMUNITY COMMUNITY?

To protect everyone, most of us need to be vaccinated.

This chart shows the current percentage of children who are fully vaccinated in our school. If we have gaps in our vaccination rate we put our whole community at risk.

Join the Immunity Community and learn how we are uniting against disease.

www.vaxnorthwest.org
We’re In This Together Flyers

My Family
Your Family
Our Community

Remember that you are in the majority when it comes to vaccinating kids. 65% of Washington’s children are fully vaccinated against 15 diseases. Join the Immunity Community and learn how we are uniting against disease.

Together, families can protect families.

It takes unity to fight disease, and we’re doing it. 65% Washington’s kids are vaccinated against 15 diseases. Join the Immunity Community and learn how to unite against disease.

Vaccination rates supplied by the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention 2010 National Immunization Survey.
One More Reason Flyers

One More Reason to Unite on Vaccines: Stop Disease

One More Reason to Unite on Vaccines: Everyone Benefits

One More Reason to Unite on Vaccines: Strengthen Natural Immunity

One More Reason to Unite on Vaccines: Protect Your Friends & Family

One More Reason to Unite on Vaccines: Community Immunity

Vaccines protect kids and slow the spread of diseases in our community. Join the Immunity Community and learn how we are uniting against disease.

By choosing to vaccinate we can put an end to vaccine-preventable diseases in our community or school. Join the Immunity Community and learn how we are uniting against disease.

Vaccines train the body to fight off 15 different diseases. In fact, vaccinated children have been shown to suffer fewer infections overall than unvaccinated children. Join the Immunity Community and learn how we are uniting against disease.

Some members of our community are too young, too old, or too sick to be vaccinated. Join the Immunity Community and learn how we are uniting against disease.

Vaccination creates a protective barrier against disease that helps us all. By vaccinating, we protect our entire community. Join the Immunity Community and learn how we are uniting against disease.
Community Flyers

**WHY WE VACCINATE...**

Getting our kids VACCINATED is a civic duty to PREVENT DISEASE. We followed the recommended schedule and our kids are thriving!

- Brian and Carrie, Seattle

**WHY WE VACCINATE...**

I believe VACCINATION is the BEST WAY to keep my daughters and our whole community HEALTHY.

- Sarah Seattle

**WHY WE VACCINATE...**

As NEW PARENTS, we're doing EVERYTHING POSSIBLE to keep our baby SAFE and HEALTHY. Vaccination is one more way to do that.

- Jason and Saira, Seattle
5 Reasons Card

5 Reasons to Unite on Vaccines:

1. **Stop Disease**
   Vaccines protect children against 14 diseases

2. **Protect Those Who Cannot Be Vaccinated**
   Young babies, the elderly, and people with weak immune systems sometimes can’t get vaccinated against certain diseases

3. **Keep Our Community Healthy**
   When most of us are vaccinated we can create community immunity to protect us all

4. **Strengthen Your Immunity**
   Vaccines train the body to fight off diseases

5. **Benefits Us All**
   By choosing to vaccinate we can put an end to certain diseases

---

**Join the Immunity Community**

Visit vaxnorthwest.org to unite against preventable disease

Get the vaccine schedule:
[link to schedule]

Find out the immunization rate of your child’s school:
schooldigger.com/WAimmunization/

More great resources:

- Washington State Department of Health: doh.wa.gov/YouandYourFamily/Immunization.aspx
- Centers for Disease Control and Prevention: cdc.gov/vaccines/parents/index.html
- The American Academy of Pediatrics: aap.org/immunization
- National Network for Immunization Information: immunizationinfo.org
- Shot by Shot: shotbyshot.org

---

© 2012 Vax Northwest
Viral Images
Swag
Take Away

• Taking complicated vaccines information can be accessible and easy and sharable for parents

• Building messages and consistent branding is key to awareness

• An integrated campaign with multiple tactics matter – people will find the handful of tactics that speak to them and they will make them their own
Aims of the evaluation

Document the specific details of the intervention to facilitate the spread of the intervention.

Provide formative feedback for continuous improvement in each phase of the pilot.

Gather evidence that the intervention contributed to the desired outcomes.

Identify best practices and factors that contribute to successful implementation.
## Intended intervention outcomes (logic model)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Short term</th>
<th>Intermediate</th>
<th>Long term</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Recruit/train sites and parent advocates</td>
<td>Attitudes supporting vaccinations</td>
<td>Improved immunization rates in targeted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Changed behaviors: Decreased refusal/delay, fewer exemptions</td>
<td>communities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Local policy change: community level</td>
<td>Hesitancy not a major contributor for those</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sites take action to increase awareness</td>
<td></td>
<td>not immunizing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parents more aware of immunization issues</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Campaign messages reach community at large</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Evaluation Activities

- Observation & document review
- Activity & media tracking
- Parent survey
- Key informant interviews
- Parent focus groups
# Short-term outcomes: Successful program expansion

## Program Components

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year 1</th>
<th>Year 2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>4 sites recruited</strong></td>
<td><strong>7 sites</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3 sites continue 4 new sites recruited</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>6 PAs</strong></td>
<td><strong>13 PAs</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Initial PA training
- Additional training
- Technical assistance
- Enhanced technical assistance
- Program materials
- Expanded program materials
- VaxNW website, including password protected pages
- VaxNW website updated with new pages
Short-term outcomes: Efforts to raise awareness

- Sites monitor vaccination rates
- Educate parents
- Generate conversation via social media
Short-term outcomes: Efforts to raise awareness

Parent activities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Site</th>
<th>Total activities</th>
<th>Email</th>
<th>Materials</th>
<th>Blog</th>
<th>Conversations</th>
<th>Events*</th>
<th>Meetings</th>
<th>Facebook</th>
<th>Other**</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>126</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>68</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>23</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>78</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>52</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>32</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>20</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

All sites: 399
Short-term outcomes: Messages reach community

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2011-12</th>
<th>2012-13</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Visits</td>
<td>1,356</td>
<td>2,215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unique visitors</td>
<td>878</td>
<td>1,277</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pageviews</td>
<td>4,242</td>
<td>6,619</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unique pageviews</td>
<td>3,083</td>
<td>5,020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average visit duration (minutes)</td>
<td>2.33</td>
<td>3.08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New visits</td>
<td>65%</td>
<td>54%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

For each page:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
<th>2011-12</th>
<th>2012-13</th>
<th>Average minutes on page</th>
<th>Shares (number of clicks)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>About vaccines</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>155</td>
<td>1.11</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FAQs</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>1.32</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schedule</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>1.37</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reasons to vaccinate</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>181</td>
<td>2.15</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resources</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>113</td>
<td>3.27</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Immunity Community*</td>
<td>315</td>
<td>315</td>
<td>2.48</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Why we vaccinate*</td>
<td>153</td>
<td>153</td>
<td>3.14</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*New pages in 2012-13
Short-term outcomes: Messages reach community

How Social Networks Influence Parents’ Decision to Vaccinate

A small group of parent advocates is mobilizing “gentle propaganda” against vaccine naysayers. By Bonnie Rochman, April 15, 2013

At her son’s preschool near Seattle, Robin Haight is a foot soldier in the vaccine wars. She arranged for a pediatrician to speak about vaccines at the home of a school parent. She put up posters — she calls them “gentle propaganda” — that touted the importance of immunization in stopping the spread of disease. Her husband helped create a spreadsheet to track which children at the school are missing which vaccinations.

Some parents have said that Haight’s pro-vaccination message has no place at preschool, that it’s disrespectful and patronizing, that the decision to vaccinate a child is nobody else’s business. One mother got so emotional that she broke out in hives. But Haight thinks a conversation is critical, and the latest research published in the journal *Pediatrics* backs her up.

“I’m just trying to let people know that if you don’t vaccinate your children, it might affect other children’s health,” says Haight. “It directly affects a community of young children. How do we not talk about this?”

(MORE: Jenny McCarthy, Vaccine Expert? A Quarter of Parents Trust Celebrities)
Outcomes – Parent survey

Pre/post, cross-sectional web-based survey

Purpose

Response rates: Pre n=329, Post n=135
Low response: post n ~10% of total families

Analysis
Short-term outcomes: Increased parental knowledge

- I have heard/read that some parents are refusing or delaying vaccinations for their child(ren): Pre 100%, Post 99%
- I have heard/read information about “vaccine hesitancy”: Pre 79%, Post 82%
- I know the vaccination and exemption rates in my state: Pre 31%, Post 35%
- I know the vaccination and exemption rates at my child’s child care/daycare/school*: Pre 17%, Post 25%
- I personally know children who were harmed by vaccines: Pre 11%, Post 15%

*Trend toward statistical significance (p = .079)
Intermediate outcomes: Change in parental attitudes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>How confident are you that vaccinating your child is a good decision?</th>
<th>How concerned are you about the safety of vaccines?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pre: 8.8, Post: 8.8</td>
<td>Pre: 5.0, Post: 4.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Intermediate outcomes: Change in parental attitudes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Pre</th>
<th>Post</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Not at all hesitant</td>
<td>38%</td>
<td>41%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not too hesitant</td>
<td>41%</td>
<td>40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Somewhat hesitant</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Very hesitant</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Intermediate outcomes: Change in parental behaviors

- Has ever refused or delayed getting child(ren) vaccinated
  - Pre: 36%
  - Post: 30%

- Has signed or plans to sign exemption form
  - Pre: 12%
  - Post: 8%
Intermediate outcomes: Policy change

Community–level policy change

OPEP (Organization of Parent Education Programs) adopted changes to risk management manual → Potential to impact 10,000 Washington state families
Next Steps

Complete Year 3 of IC program: June 2014

Complete Year 3 evaluation & reports: July 2014

Develop marketing and dissemination plans for IC program expansion: by end of 2014

Submit paper to peer-reviewed journal: by end of 2014
THANK YOU:

- Group Health Foundation
- Parent Advocates and Site Representatives
- Community Advisory Board Members
Contact Us:

Mackenzie Melton, MPH, Immunization Project Coordinator, WithinReach - (206) 830-7644 / mackenziem@withinreachwa.org

Dawn Crawford, Principle Communicator, BCDC Ideas
(720) 231-1930 / dawnacrawford@gmail.com

Clarissa Hsu, PhD, Senior Program Manager/Research Associate, CCHE / GHRI
(206) 287-4276 / hsu.c@ghc.org

Jennie Schoeppe, MPH, Research Associate, CCHE / GHRI
(206) 287-2200 / schoeppe.j@ghc.org